

ELS REYNAERS KINI

**The Precautionary Principle,
Multilateral Treaties and the
Formation of Customary International Law**

A Symptom of a Larger Conundrum?

Editions interuniversitaires suisses – Edis

2008

Contents

References.....	XI
Introduction.....	1
Chapter I	
The evolution of the precautionary principle.....	9
A. The rise of the precautionary principle and its core characteristics.....	9
B. From a regulator's point of view: risk assessment and risk management, or the link between science, the precautionary principle and political choices.....	18
C. The precautionary principle under the SPS Agreement	21
1. Relevant provisions of the SPS Agreement.....	22
2. Critique on the SPS Agreement	24
Chapter II	
The precautionary principle in the EU and the US.....	29
A. The explicit developments in the EU.....	30
1. The EC Treaty.....	30
2. The Commission's Communication and the Council's decision	30
3. ECJ and CFI case law	33
4. Trends in EU case law and legislation	40
B. The implied applications in the US.....	41
1. Legislation.....	42
2. Case law	44
3. Policy and regulatory trends.....	46
Chapter III	
Not just customary international law yet	53
A. The opportunities before the ICJ.....	54
1. Second Nuclear Test case (1995).....	54
2. Advisory Opinion – Nuclear Weapons (1996).....	54
3. Gabcikovo-Nagymaros case (1997).....	55

4. Pulp Mills case (2006-)	57
B. The lone case before the European Court of Human Rights (1997)	60
C. The aborted Southern Bluefin Tuna case before the International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea (2000)	60
D. The OSPAR Convention Arbitration - MOX Plant (2003)	62
1. The facts and the Award	62
2. Operational versus Litigational approaches	65
E. The WTO jurisprudence under the SPS Agreement	66
1. Hormones case (1997)	67
2. Salmon case (1998)	70
3. Agricultural products case (1999)	71
4. Apples case (2003)	72
5. Panel – GMO case (2006)	73
a. On the precautionary principle	75
b. International law applicable ‘between the parties’	76
c. No appeal – consequences for future environment and health disputes	79
6. Explaining some of the hesitation by the WTO courts	80

Chapter IV

A contextual analysis of customary international law	83
A. ICJ cases on CIL	83
1. The two prerequisite elements of CIL	83
2. Time element	85
3. The importance of the psychological element	86
4. State Practice element	88
B. Persistent Objector rule and its relevance for the US	90
C. Disagreement galore	95
1. Inherent circularity of the psychological element	95
2. Evidence in support of the State practice element	99
3. The relationship between State practice and opinio juris	100
a. Kirgis’ sliding scale	102
b. Roberts’ reflective interpretive approach	103
4. Treaties and MEAs as a source of CIL	106
a. Treaties can create CIL – an overview of ‘classic’ and more ‘radical’ views	106
b. Scott and Carr’s three-part test for (environmental) multilateral treaties	112
c. Weisburd’s opinio juris	117
5. Empirical analysis	119

D. Stocktaking of the CIL theory and its repercussion on the precautionary principle	121
1. Overlooking the CIL theory	121
2. CIL relating to transboundary environmental harm	123
3. A new environmental CIL based on what States ‘say’	126
a. New wine in old bottles	126
b. Multilateral treaties as a catalyst for a new CIL theory ...	131
c. Leapfrogging towards a jus cogens status?.....	134
4. The present utility of the precautionary principle in international disputes	137
a. A guide to interpretation, not an obligation.....	137
b. Sharpening the precautionary principle as a litigation tool	140
5. Awaiting a judgment by the ICJ.....	141
a. The weight of a Judgment by the ICJ	141
b. Judicial restraint by the ICJ	144
c. The International Court of Justice renders ‘justice’	144
6. Final overview and critique.....	147
Concluding Remarks.....	151
Annexes	157
I. Rio Declaration on Environment and Development	157
II. Provisions relevant to the precautionary principle in the EC Treaty, MEAs and the North Sea Declarations	163