

Evidence-Based Management

How to use evidence to make better
organizational decisions

Eric Barends and Denise M Rousseau



CONTENTS

About the authors xiii

Contributors xiv

Foreword xv

Preface xxi

How to read (and use) this book xxv

Acknowledgements xxix

01 Evidence-based management: the basic principles (with Rob Briner) 1

- 1.1 What is evidence-based management? 2
- 1.2 What counts as evidence? 3
- 1.3 Why do we need evidence-based management? 3
- 1.4 What sources of evidence should be considered? 5
- 1.5 Why do we have to critically appraise evidence? 11
- 1.6 Why focus on the 'best available' evidence? 12
- 1.7 Some common misconceptions of evidence-based management 13
- 1.8 What is the evidence for evidence-based management? 16

02 ASK: Critical questions about assumed problems and preferred solutions 20

- 2.1 Identifying underlying assumptions 21
- 2.2 Starting point: What is the problem to solve or opportunity to address? 23
- 2.3 PICOC 24
- 2.4 Step 1: What is the assumed problem to be solved? 26
- 2.5 Step 2: What is the evidence for the problem? 31
- 2.6 Step 3: What is the preferred solution? 35
- 2.7 Step 4: What is the evidence for the preferred solution? 38
- 2.8 Developing your capacity to ask questions 42
- 2.9 Checklists 43

PART ONE Evidence from practitioners 49

03 ACQUIRE: Evidence from practitioners 51

- 3.1 What to ask? 51
- 3.2 Whom to ask? 53
- 3.3 How many practitioners should I ask? 53
- 3.4 How to ask? 55
- 3.5 Developing questions 57
- 3.6 Eight tips for asking valid and effective questions 57

04 APPRAISE: Evidence from practitioners 61

- 4.1 How to tell whether a practitioner has professional expertise 62
- 4.2 Why is it so hard to develop valid and reliable professional expertise? 64
- 4.3 Two modes of thinking 65
- 4.4 Cognitive biases 68
- 4.5 Avoiding or reducing bias 74
- 4.6 Critical appraisal of evidence from practitioners 77
- 4.7 Checklist 82

PART TWO Evidence from the scientific literature 85

05 A short introduction to science (with Rob Briner) 87

- 5.1 What is science? 87
- 5.2 Science is not about 'truth' or 'proof' 90
- 5.3 Limitation 1: Coincidence 91
- 5.4 Limitation 2: Methodological bias 94
- 5.5 Limitation 3: Confounders 95
- 5.6 Limitation 4: The placebo effect 97
- 5.7 Limitation 5: Moderators and mediators 98
- 5.8 Qualitative versus quantitative research 99
- 5.9 Research designs 101
- 5.10 How to read a research article 106

06	ACQUIRE: Evidence from the scientific literature	110
6.1	The scientific literature	111
6.2	Determining your search terms	114
6.3	Searching in research databases: Some basic search techniques	118
6.4	Pre-testing your search terms	121
6.5	Searching for empirical studies: Systematic, transparent and reproducible	123
6.6	Finally, some tips	134
07	APPRAISE: Evidence from the scientific literature (with Rob Briner)	137
7.1	Critical appraisal: Three preliminary questions	138
7.2	Critical appraisal: Methodological appropriateness	143
7.3	Methodological appropriateness: Cause-and-effect studies	144
7.4	Methodological appropriateness: Non-effect studies	151
7.5	Critical appraisal: Methodological quality	157
7.6	Finally: The 'best available' evidence	165
7.7	Overview of the appraisal process	167
7.8	Checklists	168
PART THREE Evidence from the organization		173
08	ACQUIRE: Evidence from the organization (with Martin Walker)	175
8.1	Why is evidence from the organization important?	175
8.2	From data to information and evidence	176
8.3	What questions to ask?	177
8.4	What types of organizational evidence are typically available?	179
8.5	Big data	181
8.6	Where to find organizational evidence	182
8.7	Techniques and tools for acquiring data	184
8.8	Organizational data turned into information	186
8.9	Other considerations when acquiring data	191

09 APPRAISE: Evidence from the organization (with Martin Walker) 194

- 9.1 Barrier 1: Absence of a logic model 195
- 9.2 Barrier 2: Irrelevant data 197
- 9.3 Barrier 3: Inaccurate data 199
- 9.4 Barrier 4: Missing contextual information 201
- 9.5 Barrier 5: Measurement error 202
- 9.6 Barrier 6: The small number problem 203
- 9.7 Barrier 7: Confusing percentages and averages 204
- 9.8 Barrier 8: Misleading graphs 208
- 9.9 Barrier 9: Correlations and regressions – overfitting the data 212
- 9.10 Barrier 10: Wide confidence intervals 217
- 9.11 Artificial intelligence, machine learning and artificial neural networks 218
- 9.12 Organizational evidence: Quality versus purpose 219
- 9.13 Checklist 220

PART FOUR Evidence from stakeholders 223

10 ACQUIRE: Evidence from stakeholders 225

- 10.1 Not all evidence from stakeholders is stakeholder evidence 226
- 10.2 Types of stakeholders 228
- 10.3 Who are the most relevant stakeholders? 229
- 10.4 Whom to ask? 232
- 10.5 What to ask? 233
- 10.6 How to ask? 235

11 APPRAISE: Evidence from stakeholders 240

- 11.1 The importance of subjective feelings and perceptions 241
- 11.2 What is the impact of the decision? 241
- 11.3 Representativeness 242
- 11.4 How representative is my sample? 243
- 11.5 Checklist 245

- 12 AGGREGATE: Weighing and pulling together the evidence 246**
 - 12.1 Evidence-based management is about probabilities 248
 - 12.2 Bayes' Rule 250
 - 12.3 The prior probability 252
 - 12.4 The likelihood of the evidence 252
 - 12.5 Updating the posterior probability when new evidence becomes available 256
 - 12.6 Using Bayes' Rule to aggregate evidence from different sources 258
 - 12.7 Bayesian thinking 263

- 13 APPLY: Incorporating the evidence into the decision-making process (with Alessandra Capezio) 268**
 - 13.1 Does the evidence apply? 269
 - 13.2 What is the expected value? 270
 - 13.3 Is it the biggest bang for your buck? 272
 - 13.4 Is the level of risk acceptable? 272
 - 13.5 Are there ethical issues to consider? 274
 - 13.6 Is the evidence actionable? 275
 - 13.7 Are there moderators that you need to take into account? 278
 - 13.8 How and in what form can you apply the evidence? 279
 - 13.9 Dissemination, implementation and change 282

- 14 ASSESS: Evaluate the outcome of the decision taken 287**
 - 14.1 Types of decisions 288
 - 14.2 Assessing the outcome: Two preliminary questions 289
 - 14.3 Assess: The gold standard 291
 - 14.4 Assess: The silver standard 296
 - 14.5 Outcome measures 300
 - 14.6 Assessing stakeholder effects 301
 - 14.7 Keep it simple! 302

15 Building the capacity for evidence-based management 306

- 15.1 Becoming an evidence-based manager 307
- 15.2 Building evidence-based capacity among bosses and peers 310
- 15.3 Building evidence-based capacity in your organization 314
- 15.4 Some final words 317

16 Guidelines for critically appraised topics 321

- 16.1 Step 1: Background – What is the context of the CAT question? 322
- 16.2 Step 2: Formulating the CAT question – What does the CAT answer? 324
- 16.3 Step 3: PICOC 326
- 16.4 Step 4: Inclusion criteria – Which studies will be considered? 326
- 16.5 Step 5: Search strategy – How should the studies be sought? 327
- 16.6 Step 6: Study selection – How should you select the studies? 328
- 16.7 Step 7: Data extraction – What information should you extract 329
- 16.8 Step 8: Critical appraisal – How should the quality of the studies be judged? 329
- 16.9 Step 9: Results – What did you find? 333
- 16.10 Step 10: Conclusion 336
- 16.11 Step 11: Limitations 337
- 16.12 Step 12: Implications and recommendations 338
- 16.13 Checklist 341

Glossary 343

Index 350