

# **The Meaning of “Enterprise”, “Business” and “Business Profits” under Tax Treaties and EU Tax Law**

edited by  
Prof. Guglielmo Maisto



Vol. 7  
EC and International Tax Law Series

---

## Table of Contents

<b>Acknowledgements</b>	v
<b>Foreword</b>	vii
 Part One EU Tax Law	
<b>Chapter 1: “Enterprise”, “Business” and “Business Profits” in EU Tax Law</b> <i>Pasquale Pistone</i>	3
1.1. Introduction	3
1.2. An empirical reconstruction of the three concepts based on ECJ case law	4
1.3. A more focused analysis of undertakings in the light of State aid case law	10
1.4. Selected issues concerning secondary tax law	12
1.4.1. Directives in the field of direct taxes	12
1.4.2. VAT Directive 2006/112/EC	17
1.4.3. The Capital Duty Directive	18
1.5. Legal instruments of EU tax coordination	19
1.6. Conclusions	20
 <b>Chapter 2: Extra-Textual References to “Enterprise” and “Business” in the European VAT Directive</b> <i>Andrea Parolini</i>	 23
2.1. Introduction	23
2.2. The “no-supply” rule enshrined in Art. 19 of the VAT Directive	24
2.2.1. In general	24
2.2.2. The concept of “totality of assets or part thereof” according to the ECJ	25
2.3. Open questions	27

## Table of Contents

---

### Part Two Tax Law

#### **Chapter 3: The Meaning of “Enterprise”, “Business” and “Business Profits” in Domestic Tax Law** 31 *Luc De Broe*

- 3.1. Introduction 31
- 3.2. Civil law vs common law: Main similarities  
and differences 32
- 3.3. Civil law 33
- 3.4. Common law 37

#### **Chapter 4: “Enterprise”, “Business” and “Business Profits”: From the League of Nations to the Current OECD Model Tax Convention** 41 *Jacques Sasseville*

- 4.1. Introduction 41
- 4.2. The 1928 models of the League of Nations 41
- 4.3. The 1943 Mexico Model and the 1946 London Model 42
- 4.4. The OEEC reports 44
- 4.5. The deletion of Art. 14 in the 2000 Update 50
- 4.6. The 2008 and 2010 Updates 51
- 4.7. Interpretation of the treaty concepts of “enterprise”,  
“business” and “business profits” 53
  - 4.7.1. The concept of “enterprise” 53
  - 4.7.2. The concept of “business” 55
  - 4.7.3. The concept of “business profits” 57

### Part Three Special Issues in Tax Treaty Law

#### **Chapter 5: “Enterprise” and “Enterprise of a Contracting State”: Towards a Century of Confusion Regarding the Term “Enterprise” in the Model Double Taxation Conventions** 61 *Kees van Raad*

- 5.1. Introduction 61
- 5.2. Inventory and analysis of the use of the term  
“enterprise” in the 2010 OECD Model 62

5.2.1.	Inventory	62
5.2.2.	Analysis	64
5.3.	The term “enterprise” in the League of Nations Models	65
5.3.1.	Introduction	65
5.3.2.	The 1925 Resolutions	65
5.3.3.	The 1927 Draft Convention	67
5.3.4.	The 1931 Draft Plurilateral Convention	68
5.3.5.	The 1933 Draft Convention on the Allocation of Business Income	69
5.3.6.	The Mexico and London Drafts	70
5.4.	Evaluation of the use of the term “enterprise” in the League of Nations draft conventions	72
5.5.	Proposal	72
<b>Chapter 6: “Business” and “Business Profits”</b>		85
<i>Alexander Rust</i>		
6.1.	Introduction	85
6.2.	Consequences of an interpretation in the light of domestic law	86
6.3.	Consequences of an interpretation taking the context into account	91
6.4.	Relationship between Art. 7 and other distributive rules	93
6.4.1.	The meaning of the terms “dependent and independent”	95
6.4.2.	Distributive rules considered <i>leges speciales</i> to Art. 15 or to Art. 7	96
6.4.3.	Distributive rules that deal with special aspects of an independent or dependent activity	97
6.4.4.	Distributive rules that partially overlap with Art. 7	97
6.4.5.	Final thoughts on the relationship of Art. 7 to other distributive rules	100
6.5.	Consequences for the application of Art. 23A	103
6.6.	Conclusions for the interpretation of the terms “business” and “business profits”	106
<b>Chapter 7: The term “Enterprise” and Art. 24 of the OECD Model Convention</b>		107
<i>Michael Lang</i>		
7.1.	Meaning of the term “enterprise” in Art. 24 OECD Model Convention	107
7.2.	Legislative developments	108

## Table of Contents

---

7.3.	The term “enterprise” in the light of the objective and purpose of Art. 24 OECD Model	112
7.4.	The term “enterprise” in the context of the Model Convention	113
7.5.	Significance of domestic law?	116
7.6.	Conclusion	122

### Part Four Country Reports

<b>Chapter 8: Australia</b>	127
<i>Graeme S. Cooper</i>	

8.1.	The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in domestic non-tax law	127
8.1.1.	“Enterprise” in domestic law	128
8.1.2.	“Business” in domestic law	129
8.2.	The meaning of “enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” in domestic tax law	132
8.2.1.	“Enterprise” in domestic tax law	132
8.2.1.1.	Income tax	132
8.2.1.2.	Indirect taxes	132
8.2.2.	“Business” in domestic tax law	135
8.2.2.1.	Business vs expensive hobby or pastime	137
8.2.2.2.	Business vs isolated profit-making transaction	139
8.2.2.3.	Business vs investment	141
8.2.2.4.	CFC provisions and proposals	143
8.2.3.	“Business profit” in domestic income tax law	144
8.2.3.1.	Capital gains vs revenue receipts	144
8.2.3.2.	Receipts vs profits	145
8.2.3.3.	Investment income as business profits	146
8.3.	Comparison with the meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in EU tax law	147
8.4.	“Enterprise”, “business” and “profits” as interpreted for the purposes of tax treaties	147
8.4.1.	Australia’s tax treaty practice	147
8.4.1.1.	The impact of Art. 13 on business profits	148
8.4.1.2.	Modern treaty practice for business profits under Art. 13	150
8.4.2.	Interpretation of treaties	153

8.4.2.1.	The meaning of “enterprise”	153
8.4.2.2.	Including isolated transactions as a “business”	154
8.4.2.3.	Gains of a speculator as business profits vs profits from the alienation of property	155
8.4.2.4.	Revenue gains of an ongoing business as business profits vs profits from the alienation of property	156
8.4.2.5.	Capital gains of an ongoing business	158
8.4.2.6.	Investment income as business profits	161
8.4.3.	“Enterprise” and “business profits” from source-state perspective or the State of residence-state perspective	163
8.5.	Compatibility between domestic tax law and tax treaties	164
<b>Chapter 9: Austria</b>		<b>167</b>
	<i>Elke Aumayr</i>	
9.1.	The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in domestic non-tax law	167
9.1.1.	General	167
9.1.2.	The meaning of “enterprise” in Austrian commercial law	168
9.2.	The meaning of “enterprise”, “business” and “business profits in domestic tax law	171
9.2.1.	The meaning of “enterprise” in domestic tax law	171
9.2.2.	The meaning of “business” and “business profits” in domestic tax law	174
9.2.3.	The meaning of “place of business” in domestic tax law	176
9.3.	The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in EU tax law	179
9.3.1.	General	179
9.3.2.	Implementation of the term “economic activity” in Austrian VAT law	180
9.3.3.	Implementation of Art. 11 of VAT Directive 2006/112/EC	182
9.4.	“Enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” as interpreted for the purposes of tax treaties	183
9.4.1.	Austria’s tax treaty practice	183

## Table of Contents

---

9.4.1.1.	General	183
9.4.1.2.	Taxation of business profits	183
9.4.1.3.	The definition of “permanent establishment”	184
9.4.1.4.	Independent personal services	185
9.4.2.	The interpretation of tax treaties	186
9.4.2.1.	General	186
9.4.2.2.	Treaty interpretation in Austria	189
9.4.3.	“Enterprise” and “business profits” from the source-state perspective or the residence-state perspective	191
9.4.3.1.	General	191
9.4.3.2.	Austria as the state of residence	192
9.4.3.3.	Austria as the state of source	192
9.5.	Compatibility of Austria’s domestic tax law with tax treaties and EU law	193
<b>Chapter 10: Belgium</b>		197
<i>Katrien Willoqué and Ellen Cassaer</i>		
10.1.	The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in domestic non-tax law	197
10.1.1.	Belgian economic law: Commercial vs non-commercial	197
10.1.2.	The term “enterprise” in legal literature	199
10.1.3.	“Enterprise” in Belgian economic law	200
10.1.3.1.	Accounting law	200
10.1.3.2.	Belgian legislation on the registration of enterprises	201
10.1.3.3.	Competition law	201
10.1.3.4.	Market practices and consumer protection	202
10.1.3.5.	Belgian act on continuity of enterprises	202
10.1.3.6.	Conclusion: There is no such thing as “the enterprise” in Belgian non-tax law	203
10.1.4.	<i>De lege ferenda</i> ...	203
10.1.5.	“Business” – the most notable absentee in Belgian non-tax law	204
10.1.5.1.	Determination of the place of business is a matter of fact	205
10.1.6.	“Enterprise”, “business” and holding companies	206
10.2.	The meaning of “enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” in domestic tax law	207

10.2.1.	“Enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” in Belgian income tax law: Introduction	207
10.2.2.	“Business”: A non-existent term in Belgian income tax	207
10.2.3.	The terms “enterprise” and “business profits” in personal income tax	208
10.2.3.1.	Carrying on an enterprise: Profits	209
10.2.3.2.	Carrying on of a professional service or other professional activities of an independent character: Benefits	209
10.2.3.3.	Benefits vs profits	210
10.2.4.	“Enterprise and “business profits”: Corporate income tax vs legal entities tax	210
10.2.4.1.	“Company” in income tax law vs “company” in corporate law	211
10.2.4.2.	“Company”, “enterprise” and “business”	212
10.2.4.3.	Investment and holding activities	213
10.2.4.4.	Non-profit organizations	214
10.2.4.5.	Examples	214
10.2.4.6.	Business profits	216
10.2.5.	“Business”, “enterprise” and “business profits” in Belgian income tax	217
10.2.6.	Non-resident tax and place of business	217
10.2.7.	“Enterprise” in other kind of taxes	220
10.3.	The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in EU tax law	221
10.3.1.	EU direct tax law	221
10.3.2.	VAT legislation	222
10.3.2.1.	The meaning of “economic activity” in EU tax law	222
10.3.2.2.	The meaning of “economic activity” and “enterprise” in Belgian VAT law	223
10.3.2.3.	VAT grouping	225
10.4.	“Enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” as interpreted for the purposes of tax treaties	226
10.4.1.	Belgium’s tax treaty practice	226
10.4.1.1.	Introduction	226
10.4.1.2.	The concepts of “enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” in Belgium’s tax treaties	227
10.4.2.	The interpretation of tax treaties	228
10.4.2.1.	Introduction	228



## Table of Contents

---

10.4.2.2. The Vienna Convention and Art. 3(2) of the OECD Model	229
10.4.2.3. The Belgian Standard Model Draft	232
10.4.2.4. The Belgian tax administration's view point	234
10.4.2.5. Interpretation of the concepts "enterprise", "business" and "business profits"	235
10.4.3. "Enterprise" and "business profits" from the source-state perspective or the residence-state perspective	237
10.5. Compatibility of domestic tax law provisions with EU law and tax treaties	240
 <b>Chapter 11: Canada</b>	 245
<i>Kim Brooks</i>	
11.1. Function of the concept of "business" in Canadian tax law	245
11.2. The meaning of "enterprise" and "business" in Canadian non-tax law	248
11.3. The meaning of "enterprise", "business" and "business profits" in Canadian tax law	250
11.3.1. Distinguishing non-deductible personal expenses and deductible business expenses	250
11.3.2. Distinguishing non-taxable amounts with no source from business income	255
11.3.3. Distinguishing business income from other sources of income	255
11.3.3.1. Distinguishing employment income from business income	255
11.3.3.2. Distinguishing income from property from business income	258
11.3.3.3. Distinguishing capital gains from business income	259
11.3.3.4. Business income as a measure of geographic nexus	260
11.4. Differences between income tax law and other tax legislation	263
11.5. Enterprise," "business" and "business profits" as interpreted for purposes of tax treaties	263
11.5.1. State tax treaty practice	263
11.5.1.1. Definitions	264

11.5.1.2. Permanent establishment	265
11.5.1.3. Business profits	267
11.5.1.4. Non-discrimination	270
11.6. Compatibility of Canadian tax law with Canada's tax treaties	271
<b>Chapter 12: France</b>	<b>273</b>
<i>Nicolas Message</i>	
12.1. Introduction	273
12.2. The meaning of "enterprise" and "business" in French domestic non-tax law	273
12.2.1. The French definitions of "business" and "enterprise"	274
12.2.1.1. The commercial business ( <i>fonds de commerce</i> )	274
12.2.1.2. The agricultural business ( <i>fonds agricole</i> )	275
12.2.1.3. The crafts business ( <i>fonds artisanal</i> )	276
12.2.1.4. The civil business ( <i>fonds civil</i> or <i>fonds d'exercice libéral</i> )	277
12.2.2. The place of "businesses" and "enterprises" under French domestic non-tax law	278
12.3. Meaning of "enterprise", "business" and "business profits" in domestic tax law	280
12.3.1. The meaning of "enterprise", "business" and "business profits" according to the French territoriality principle	282
12.3.2. Other considerations as regard to the meaning of "enterprise", "business" and "business profits" in domestic tax law	283
12.3.2.1. The profitability criterion	283
12.3.2.2. The economical criterion: Real spot of convergence	284
12.3.2.3. Other nuances deriving from commercial taxes	285
12.3.3. Holding companies and fictitious companies	285
12.3.3.1. Holding companies and holding activities	285
12.3.3.2. Fictitious companies	286
12.4. The meaning of "enterprise" and "business" in EU tax law	287
12.4.1. EU tax law widens the borders of the domestic definitions "enterprise" and "business"	287

## Table of Contents

---

12.4.1.1.	The ECJ <i>Papillon</i> case	287
12.4.1.2.	Common Consolidated Tax Base	288
12.4.2.	“Enterprise” and “business” in EU VAT legislation	288
12.4.2.1.	Implementation of the term “economic activity” in French VAT	288
12.4.2.2.	Definition of “economical activity” according to ECJ case law	289
12.4.2.3.	Definition of “economical activity” according to French case law	290
12.4.2.4.	Implementation of Art. 11 of the VAT directive	290
12.5.	The meaning of “enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” as interpreted for the purpose of tax treaties	290
12.5.1.	French tax law interpretation of a “permanent establishment”	291
12.5.1.1.	A place of business	291
12.5.1.2.	What is a “fixed” place of business in terms of geographical location (the location test)?	292
12.5.1.3.	What is a “fixed” place of business in terms of the time that the place is used (the duration test)?	293
12.5.1.4.	Meaning of “through which the business of an enterprise is wholly or partly carried on”	293
12.5.1.5.	Does the place of business have to be owned or rented by the taxpayer (right of use test)?	294
12.5.1.6.	Other aspects of the relationship between the place and the enterprise’s business	295
12.5.1.6.1.	Can the activity of owning and renting buildings source a PE?	295
12.5.1.6.2.	Should a business installation be autonomous?	295
12.5.2.	French interpretation of the listed examples of a permanent establishment (Art. 5(2))	296
12.5.2.1.	A place of management	297
12.5.2.2.	A branch	297

12.5.2.3. An office	298
12.5.2.4. A factory or a workshop	300
12.5.2.5. A mine, an oil or gas well, a quarry or any other place of extraction of natural resources	300
12.6. Compatibility of domestic tax law provisions with tax treaties and EU law	300
<b>Chapter 13: Germany</b>	305
<i>Sebastian Heinrichs</i>	
13.1. Introduction	305
13.2. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in domestic non-tax law	306
13.2.1. The meaning of “enterprise”	306
13.2.1.1. “Enterprise” as an object in private law	306
13.2.1.2. “Enterprise” as a subject in group law	307
13.2.1.3. “Enterprise” as a subject in competition law	309
13.2.1.4. “Enterprise” as an object in bankruptcy law	309
13.2.2. The meaning of “business”	310
13.2.2.1. “Business” as an object of reference in employment law	310
13.2.2.2. “Business” as an object of reference in commercial law	311
13.2.2.3. “Business” as an activity – commercial law and competition law	313
13.3. The meaning of “enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” in domestic tax law	314
13.3.1. The meaning of “business” in German tax law	314
13.3.1.1. “Business” in German income and municipal trade tax law	314
13.3.1.1.1. Positive requirements	315
13.3.1.1.2. Extensions by case law and special regimes	317
13.3.1.1.3. Negative statutory requirements – Demarcation between business, independent personal services, and agriculture and forestry	319

## Table of Contents

---

13.3.1.1.4.	Negative requirement by case law – Demarcation between business and mere private investment	320
13.3.1.1.5.	Legal form and business	322
13.3.1.1.6.	Special modifications – Trade Tax	323
13.3.1.2.	“Business” in inheritance and gift tax law	323
13.3.1.3.	“Business” in turnover tax law	324
13.3.1.4.	Comparison with the meaning of “business” in domestic non-tax law	324
13.3.2.	The meaning and scope of “business profits” in German income tax law	324
13.3.3.	The place of business in German tax law	325
13.3.4.	The meaning of “enterprise”	326
13.3.4.1.	“Enterprise” in income tax and trade tax law	326
13.3.4.2.	Turnover tax law	327
13.4.	The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in EU tax law	327
13.4.1.	Implementation of the term “economic activity” in domestic VAT law	328
13.4.1.1.	Examination of the domestic definition	328
13.4.1.2.	Comparison with the enterprise definition under domestic income tax law	329
13.4.2.	Art. 11 of VAT Directive 2006/112/EC ( <i>Organschaft</i> )	330
13.5.	“Enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” as interpreted for the purposes of tax treaties	331
13.5.1.	Germany’s tax treaty practice	331
13.5.1.1.	The “business” and “enterprise” definitions in Art. 3 of the OECD Model	331
13.5.1.2.	The fate of Art. 14 of the OECD Model after 2000	332
13.5.1.3.	The treaty practice on Art. 7 of the OECD Model	333
13.5.2.	The interpretation of tax treaties	333
13.5.2.1.	The meaning of “business” and “enterprise” in the field of German double taxation treaties	334

13.5.2.2. The meaning of “business profits” in the field of German double taxation treaties	337
13.5.3. “Enterprise” and “business profits” from the source-state perspective or the residence-state perspective	338
13.6. Compatibility of domestic tax law provisions with tax treaties and EU law	340
<b>Chapter 14: Italy</b>	341
<i>Francesco Avella</i>	
14.1. Introduction	341
14.2. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in domestic non-tax law	342
14.2.1. Real and personal criteria to identify entrepreneurs	342
14.2.2. The non-tax law definition for “entrepreneur”	343
14.2.3. Activity of producing or trading goods or services	345
14.2.4. Proposed Italian non-tax law meaning of “business”	351
14.2.5. Features for a “business” to qualify as an “enterprise”: Professional, organized, economic	351
14.2.6. “Enterprise” vs “professional services and other activities of an independent character”	354
14.2.7. Examples in the Commentary on Art. 5 of the OECD Model and Italian non-tax law	356
14.2.8. Holding activities and isolated commercial transactions	360
14.3. The meaning of “enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” in domestic tax law	361
14.3.1. Premise	361
14.3.2. Real and personal criteria	362
14.3.3. The real criterion: Income tax law definition for “enterprise”	362
14.3.4. “Commercial activities” under income tax law	364
14.3.5. Proposed Italian tax law meaning of “business”	367
14.3.6. Features for a business to qualify as an enterprise: Professional and economic; limited significance of organization	368
14.3.7. “Business” vs “professional services and other activities of an independent character”	372
14.3.8. The personal criterion	374

## Table of Contents

---

13.3.1.1.4.	Negative requirement by case law – Demarcation between business and mere private investment	320
13.3.1.1.5.	Legal form and business	322
13.3.1.1.6.	Special modifications – Trade Tax	323
13.3.1.2.	“Business” in inheritance and gift tax law	323
13.3.1.3.	“Business” in turnover tax law	324
13.3.1.4.	Comparison with the meaning of “business” in domestic non-tax law	324
13.3.2.	The meaning and scope of “business profits” in German income tax law	324
13.3.3.	The place of business in German tax law	325
13.3.4.	The meaning of “enterprise”	326
13.3.4.1.	“Enterprise” in income tax and trade tax law	326
13.3.4.2.	Turnover tax law	327
13.4.	The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in EU tax law	327
13.4.1.	Implementation of the term “economic activity” in domestic VAT law	328
13.4.1.1.	Examination of the domestic definition	328
13.4.1.2.	Comparison with the enterprise definition under domestic income tax law	329
13.4.2.	Art. 11 of VAT Directive 2006/112/EC ( <i>Organschaft</i> )	330
13.5.	“Enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” as interpreted for the purposes of tax treaties	331
13.5.1.	Germany’s tax treaty practice	331
13.5.1.1.	The “business” and “enterprise” definitions in Art. 3 of the OECD Model	331
13.5.1.2.	The fate of Art. 14 of the OECD Model after 2000	332
13.5.1.3.	The treaty practice on Art. 7 of the OECD Model	333
13.5.2.	The interpretation of tax treaties	333
13.5.2.1.	The meaning of “business” and “enterprise” in the field of German double taxation treaties	334

13.5.2.2. The meaning of “business profits” in the field of German double taxation treaties	337
13.5.3. “Enterprise” and “business profits” from the source-state perspective or the residence-state perspective	338
13.6. Compatibility of domestic tax law provisions with tax treaties and EU law	340
<b>Chapter 14: Italy</b>	341
<i>Francesco Avella</i>	
14.1. Introduction	341
14.2. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in domestic non-tax law	342
14.2.1. Real and personal criteria to identify entrepreneurs	342
14.2.2. The non-tax law definition for “entrepreneur”	343
14.2.3. Activity of producing or trading goods or services	345
14.2.4. Proposed Italian non-tax law meaning of “business”	351
14.2.5. Features for a “business” to qualify as an “enterprise”: Professional, organized, economic	351
14.2.6. “Enterprise” vs “professional services and other activities of an independent character”	354
14.2.7. Examples in the Commentary on Art. 5 of the OECD Model and Italian non-tax law	356
14.2.8. Holding activities and isolated commercial transactions	360
14.3. The meaning of “enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” in domestic tax law	361
14.3.1. Premise	361
14.3.2. Real and personal criteria	362
14.3.3. The real criterion: Income tax law definition for “enterprise”	362
14.3.4. “Commercial activities” under income tax law	364
14.3.5. Proposed Italian tax law meaning of “business”	367
14.3.6. Features for a business to qualify as an enterprise: Professional and economic; limited significance of organization	368
14.3.7. “Business” vs “professional services and other activities of an independent character”	372
14.3.8. The personal criterion	374



## Table of Contents

---

14.3.9. Examples in the Commentary on Art. 5 of the OECD Model and Italian tax law	377
14.3.10. Holding activities and isolated commercial transactions	379
14.4. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in EU tax law	381
14.4.1. “Enterprise” and “business” in EU tax law	381
14.4.2. The implementation of the term “economic activity” in domestic VAT law	384
14.4.3. Enterprises	385
14.4.4. Self-employment activities	387
14.4.5. The implementation of Art. 11 of Directive 2006/112	388
14.5. “Enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” as interpreted for the purposes of tax treaties	388
14.5.1. Italy’s tax treaty practice	388
14.5.2. The interpretation of Italian tax treaties	390
14.5.2.1. “Enterprise”, “business” and “business profits”	390
14.5.2.2. “Independent professional services”	396
14.5.2.3. References to the OECD Model Commentaries	396
14.5.3. “Enterprise” and “business profits” from source-state perspective or residence-state perspective	397
<b>Chapter 15: Japan</b>	399
<i>Asatsuma Akiyuki</i>	
15.1. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in domestic non-tax law	399
15.1.1. “Business” and “enterprise” in civil law	399
15.1.2. “Business” and “enterprise” in commercial law	401
15.2. The meaning of “enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” in domestic tax law	402
15.2.1. The meaning of “business profits”	402
15.2.1.1. The meaning of “business income” and “salary income”	402
15.2.1.2. The meaning of “business income” and “capital gain”	404
15.2.1.3. The meaning of “business income” and “miscellaneous income”	406

15.2.1.4. The meaning of “business income” and “dividend income”	408
15.2.2. The meaning of “business”	409
15.2.2.1. Special legislation regarding companies that are deemed not to operate a business	409
15.2.2.2. The meaning of “business” in corporate tax law	413
15.2.2.3. The meaning of “business” and “enterprise” for all other types of taxes	415
15.3. “Enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” as interpreted for the purposes of tax treaties	415
15.3.1. State’s tax treaty practice	415
15.3.1.1. Business profits provision as of Arts. 5 and 7 of the OECD Model	415
15.3.1.2. Individual service income provision as of Art. 14 of OECD MC	416
15.3.2. The interpretation of tax treaties	416
15.3.3. “Enterprise” and “business profits” from the source-state perspective or the residence-state perspective	416
15.3.3.1. From the source-state perspective	416
15.3.3.2. From the residence-state perspective	419
15.3.3.3. The potential impact of the OECD approach on conflicts of qualification	419
15.4. Compatibility of domestic tax law provisions with tax treaties	421
<b>Chapter 16: Luxembourg</b>	427
<i>Katarina Köszeghy</i>	
16.1. Introduction	427
16.2. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in domestic non-tax law	428
16.2.1. The concepts of “enterprise” and “business” in Luxembourg civil law	428
16.2.2. The concept of “enterprise” in Luxembourg commercial law	428
16.2.2.1. No legally enshrined definition of “enterprise” in Luxembourg commercial law	428
16.2.2.2. The definition of “enterprise” in Art. 8 of the Commercial Code	429

## Table of Contents

---

16.2.2.2.1. Trader as an “enterprise”	429
16.2.2.2.2. Commercial companies being an “enterprise”	431
16.2.2.2.3. Branches of non-resident companies being an “enterprise”	432
16.2.3. The meaning of “business” in Luxembourg non-tax law	432
16.2.4. The distinction between “enterprise”, “business” and “independent personal services”	433
16.2.5. The relation of domestic provisions to Art. 5 of the OECD Model	433
16.3. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in domestic tax law	435
16.3.1. The meaning of “enterprise” in the Luxembourg Income Tax Law (LITL)	435
16.3.1.1. The meaning of “enterprise” for tax-transparent entities	435
16.3.1.1.1. Income derived by an “enterprise”	436
16.3.1.1.2. A definition of “enterprise” in Art. 14(1) of the LITL	436
16.3.1.2. The meaning of “enterprise” for fiscally non-transparent entities	438
16.3.2. The meaning of “enterprise” for municipal business tax law (MBTL) purposes	439
16.3.3. The deemed “enterprise” concept created by Luxembourg income tax law	439
16.3.3.1. Extension of the meaning of “enterprise” by Art. 14(4) of the LITL ( <i>théorie de l’empreinte/ Geprügetheorie</i> )	439
16.3.3.2. Extension of the meaning of “enterprise” by Art. 14(2) of the LITL	441
16.3.3.3. The extension of the meaning of “enterprise” by the “theory of tainted income”	442
16.3.3.4. Extension of the meaning of “enterprise” by case law	442
16.3.3.5. Extension of the meaning of “enterprise” by “subordination provisions” ( <i>théorie de la subsidiarité</i> )	443

16.3.4.	Differences between “enterprise” and “independent personal services”	443
16.3.5.	The meaning of “enterprise” in the VAT law (VATL) of 5 August 1969	444
16.3.6.	The meaning of “enterprise” for Luxembourg non-resident taxpayers under LITL	445
16.4.	The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in EU tax law (VAT implementation of “economic activity”)	446
16.4.1.	The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” derived from EU law	446
16.4.2.	The implementation of “economic activity” in Luxembourg law	447
16.4.3.	The non-implementation of Art. 11 of the VAT Directive in Luxembourg law	448
16.4.4.	The meaning of “undertaking” for purposes of Art. 107 of the TFEU	449
16.4.5.	“Enterprise” in LITL vs “economic activity” in VATL	449
16.5.	“Enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” as interpreted for the purposes of tax treaties	450
16.5.1.	Luxembourg tax treaty practice	450
16.5.1.1.	Particularities of tax treaties concluded by Luxembourg	450
16.5.1.2.	Art. 14 of the OECD Model in tax treaties concluded by Luxembourg	451
16.5.2.	The interpretation of tax treaties in Luxembourg	452
16.5.2.1.	In general on the interpretation of tax treaties in Luxembourg	452
16.5.2.2.	The meaning of “enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” for tax treaty interpretation	454
16.5.2.2.1.	The definition of “enterprise” and “business”	454
16.5.2.2.2.	The definition of “business profits”	456
16.5.3.	“Enterprise” and “business profits” from the source-state perspective or the residence-state perspective	458
16.6.	Compatibility of domestic tax law provisions with tax treaties and EU law	458

<b>Chapter 17: Netherlands</b>	<b>459</b>
<i>Anna Gunn</i>	
17.1. Introduction	459
17.2. The meaning of the terms “enterprise” and “business” in Dutch non-tax law	462
17.2.1. Use of the terms “enterprise”, “business” and “profession”	462
17.2.2. Use and meaning of the term “enterprise” in the Workers’ Council Act	465
17.2.3. Use and meaning of the term “enterprise” in the Trade Register Act	466
17.2.4. Use and meaning of the term “enterprise” for the protection of employees’ rights	468
17.2.5. Use of the term “business” in the Bankruptcy Act	470
17.2.6. Distinction between entrepreneurial and investment activities	470
17.2.7. Would the examples under OECD Commentary to Art. 5 constitute a “place of business” in Dutch non-tax law?	471
17.3. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business profits” in Dutch direct tax law	472
17.3.1. Individual Income Taxation Act 2001 (IITA)	472
17.3.1.1. Overview of the system of the IITA 2001	472
17.3.1.1.1. Box 1: Taxable income from work and home ownership	473
17.3.1.1.2. Box 2: Taxable income from a substantial shareholding	474
17.3.1.1.3. Box 3: Taxable income from savings and investments	474
17.3.1.2. Meaning of the term “business profits” (Art. 3.2 IITA)	475
17.3.1.3. Meaning of the term “entrepreneur” (Art. 3.4 IITA)	476
17.3.1.4. Use of the hours-criterion (Art. 3.6 IITA)	476
17.3.1.5. Meaning of the term “enterprise”	477
17.3.1.5.1. Business profits vs wage income	478
17.3.1.5.2. Business profits vs income from other activities	478
17.3.1.5.3. Business profits vs investment income	479

17.3.1.6.	Distinction between the concepts of an “objective enterprise” and a “subjective enterprise” in Dutch tax doctrine	480
17.3.1.7.	Treatment of professional activities (Art. 3.5 IITA)	480
17.3.1.8.	Points taken into account by the Dutch tax authorities when assessing the status as entrepreneur	481
17.3.2.	Corporate Income Taxation Act 1969 (CITA)	482
17.3.2.1.	Unlimited tax liability (use of the “formal enterprise” concept under Art. 2(5) CITA)	482
17.3.2.2.	Limited tax liability (use of the concept of a “material enterprise”)	482
17.3.3.	Use and meaning of the term “enterprise” for Dutch non-resident taxpayers	483
17.3.4.	Distinction between entrepreneurial activities and investment activities	486
17.3.5.	Use and meaning of the term “enterprise” in other provisions under CITA	487
17.3.6.	Would the examples under OECD Commentary to Art. 5 constitute an “enterprise” in Dutch tax law?	488
17.4.	The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in EU law	489
17.4.1.	The Dutch VAT Act (Council Directive 2006/112/EC)	489
17.4.1.1.	Use of the term “entrepreneur” in the VAT Act	489
17.4.1.2.	Use of the concept of an “economic activity” in Dutch case law	491
17.4.1.3.	The VAT fiscal unity (Art. 7(4) VAT Act)	492
17.4.2.	Use of the term “enterprise” in the Competition Act	494
17.4.3.	Some differences between the term “economic activity” and the concept of an objective/material “enterprise” in Dutch direct tax law	496
17.5.	The meaning of the terms “enterprise” and “business profits” in Dutch tax treaties	496
17.5.1.	The Netherlands’ tax treaty practice	497
17.5.1.1.	Dutch treaty policy on the term “profit” as formulated in the 1998 Nota on international fiscal policy	497
17.5.1.2.	Meaning of the term “enterprise” in the tax treaty with Germany	498

## Table of Contents

---

17.5.1.3.	Meaning of the term “enterprise” in the tax treaty with Switzerland	499
17.5.1.4.	Inclusion of Art. 14 (Independent Personal Services) in Dutch tax treaties concluded after 2000	499
17.5.1.5.	Use of the term “enterprise” in the unilateral Decree for the Prevention of Double Taxation	500
17.5.2.	The interpretation of tax treaties	501
17.5.2.1.	Significance of the OECD Commentary for tax treaty interpretation in the Netherlands	501
17.5.2.2.	OECD Commentary on the terms “enterprise”, “business” and “business profits”	502
17.5.2.3.	Use of the mutual agreement procedure for the interpretation of the terms “enterprise” and “business profits”	504
17.5.3.	“Enterprise” and “business profits” from the source-state or residence-state perspective	505
17.5.3.1.	The Dutch interpretation of the terms “enterprise” and “business profits” where the Netherlands is source state	505
17.5.3.2.	The Dutch interpretation of the terms “enterprise” and “business profits” where the Netherlands is resident state	506
17.5.3.3.	The observation made by the Netherlands to the OECD Commentary to Art. 23A/B	507
17.5.3.4.	Alternative approaches adopted by the Netherlands towards conflicts if qualification	509
17.6.	Compatibility of provisions of Dutch domestic direct tax law with international law	509
17.6.1.	Compatibility with tax treaties	509
17.6.2.	Compatibility with EU Law	510
17.6.3.	Compatibility with international public law	512

<b>Chapter 18: United Kingdom</b>	<b>515</b>
<i>Rachael Arning</i>	
18.1. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in domestic non-tax law	515
18.1.1. The meaning of “business”	515
18.1.1.1. Consumer protection law	516
18.1.1.2. Commercial law	517
18.1.1.3. Company law	518
18.1.1.4. Insolvency	519
18.1.1.5. Professional services	521
18.1.1.6. Passive holding of investments	522
18.1.1.7. Frequency of transactions	524
18.1.2. The meaning of the word “enterprise”	524
18.1.3. Comparison of the concept of a “fixed place of business” and “professional services” in UK domestic non-tax law with the examples in the Commentary to Art.5 OECD MC	525
18.1.3.1. “Fixed place of business” in UK domestic non-tax law	525
18.1.3.2. Comparison of the concept of a “fixed place of business” and “professional services” in UK domestic non-tax law with the examples in the Commentary to Art.5 OECD MC	526
18.2. The meaning of “enterprise” “business” and “business profits” in domestic tax law	527
18.2.1. The meaning of “business”	527
18.2.1.1. Meaning of “trade”	530
18.2.1.2. Meaning of “profession or vocation”	532
18.2.1.3. Isolated transactions	532
18.2.2. Meaning of “business profits”	533
18.2.3. Holding activities	533
18.2.3.1. Companies	533
18.2.3.2. Partnerships	535
18.2.3.3. Individuals	536
18.2.4. Definition of “trade” in the context of exemptions and reliefs	536
18.2.4.1. Capital gains	536
18.2.4.1.1. Capital allowances	536
18.2.4.1.2. Incorporation relief and rollover relief	537



## Table of Contents

---

18.2.4.1.3.	Entrepreneurs' relief	538
18.2.4.1.4.	Substantial shareholding exemption	538
18.2.4.2.	Savings	539
18.2.4.2.1.	Venture Capital Trusts, Enterprise Investment Scheme and Corporate Venturing Scheme	539
18.2.4.3.	Inheritance tax	540
18.2.5.	"Fixed place of business" in UK domestic tax law	541
18.2.5.1.	Corporation tax	541
18.2.5.1.1.	Controlled foreign company (CFC) regime: The exempt activities test	542
18.2.6.	Comparison of the concept of a "fixed place of business" and "professional services" in domestic tax law with the examples in the Commentary to Art.5 OECD MC	544
18.2.7.	The meaning of "enterprise"	544
18.3.	The meaning of "enterprise" and "business" in EU tax law	545
18.3.1.	The meaning of "enterprise"	546
18.3.2.	Meaning of "business"	546
18.3.2.1.	Direct taxes	546
18.3.2.2.	Indirect tax	548
18.3.2.3.	Holding activities	551
18.3.2.4.	Art. 11 VAT Directive 2006/112/EC	552
18.3.2.5.	Anti-avoidance	553
18.4.	"Enterprise", "business" and "business profits" as interpreted for the purposes of tax treaties	555
18.4.1.	State's tax treaty practice	555
18.4.1.1.	Treaty practice in relation to the terms "enterprise", "business" and "business profits"	555
18.4.1.2.	Fixed place of business	556
18.4.1.3.	Independent personal services	559
18.4.2.	The interpretation of tax treaties	560
18.4.2.1.	Meaning of "business"	560
18.4.2.2.	Meaning of "enterprise"	561
18.4.2.3.	Meaning of "business profits"	563
18.4.2.4.	Meaning of "fixed place of business" in the PE article	565
18.4.2.5.	Mutual agreement procedure (MAP)	567

18.4.3. “Enterprise” and “business profits” from the source-state perspective or the residence-state perspective	567
18.4.3.1. “Enterprise”	567
18.4.3.2. “Business profits”	568
18.5. Compatibility of UK domestic tax law provisions with tax treaties and EU law	569
18.5.1. Compatibility of UK domestic tax law provisions with tax treaties	569
18.5.1.1. Treaty override – Legislative	569
18.5.1.2. Treaty override – Judicial	571
18.5.2. Compatibility of UK domestic tax law provisions with EU Law	572
18.5.2.1. Controlled foreign company rules	572
18.5.2.2. VAT grouping rules	573
<b>Chapter 19: United States</b>	<b>575</b>
<i>Allison Christians and Yariv Brauner</i>	
19.1. The meaning of “enterprise” and “business” in domestic non-tax law	575
19.1.1. Corporate law	575
19.1.2. The Uniform Commercial Code	579
19.1.3. Bankruptcy law	580
19.1.4. Place of business in connection with the examples in Commentary to Art. 5 of the OECD Model	581
19.2. The meaning of “business”, “enterprise” and “business profits” in domestic tax law	584
19.2.1. Business	584
19.2.1.1. Domestic law definition	584
19.2.1.2. Modifications in the case of foreign persons	587
19.2.1.2.1. Presence requirement	587
19.2.1.2.2. Ownership of assets	588
19.2.1.2.3. Treatment of services	589
19.2.1.2.4. Attribution from other taxpayers	589
19.2.2. Business entities	590
19.2.3. Business profits	591
19.3. “Enterprise”, “business” and “business profits” as interpreted for the purpose of tax treaties	594

## Table of Contents

---

19.3.1. State's tax treaty practice	594
19.3.1.1. United States Model Tax Convention	594
19.3.1.1.1. Definition of "enterprise"	594
19.3.1.1.2. Definitions of "business" and "business profits"	595
19.3.1.2. Use of terms in treaties in force	595
19.3.1.3. Art. 14 – Independent personal services	600
19.3.2. The interpretation of tax treaties	601
19.3.2.1. Definition of "enterprise"	601
19.3.2.1.1. Definition of "business"	602
19.3.2.1.2. Definition of "business profits"	603
19.3.3. "Enterprise" and "business profits" from the source-state perspective or the residence- state perspective	604
19.4. Compatibility of domestic law provisions with tax treaties	606
19.4.1. General	606
19.4.2. Relevant relationship between treaties and the Code	607

### Part Five Round-Table Discussion

<b>Chapter 20: Round Table: On the Desirability to Change the OECD Model Convention and its Commentaries</b>	611
<i>John Avery Jones, Augusto Fantozzi, Jacques Sasseville and Kees van Raad</i>	
20.1. The practical issues and questions	611
20.2. Conclusions	635
<b>Contributors</b>	639