

Assessing the Impact of Foreign Aid

Value for Money and Aid for Trade

Edited by
Viktor Jakupec
Max Kelly



ELSEVIER

AMSTERDAM • BOSTON • HEIDELBERG • LONDON
NEW YORK • OXFORD • PARIS • SAN DIEGO
SAN FRANCISCO • SINGAPORE • SYDNEY • TOKYO

Academic Press is an Imprint of Elsevier



Contents

List of Contributors	xiii
Author Biographies	xv
Preface	xxiii
 CHAPTER 1 Official Development Assistance and Impact Assessment – Theoretical and Practical Frameworks	 1
<i>Viktor Jakupec and Max Kelly</i>	
Introduction	1
Aid, ODA, and Resource Flows to the Developing World	2
Background to Foreign Aid	4
Contemporary Debates, Aid Effectiveness, Value for Money, and Aid for Trade	7
Aid Effectiveness	9
Value for Money	10
Aid, Development, Results, and Impact	10
Conclusion	12
References	13
 CHAPTER 2 Conceptualizing Impact Assessment in Foreign Aid	 17
<i>Max Kelly</i>	
Introduction	17
Results and Impact	18
The Evolution of Impact Assessment	21
Impact Assessment in Theory and Practice	23
Transparency and Accountability	25
<i>Ex-Ante</i> and <i>Ex-Post</i> IA	26
Conclusion	27
References	27
 CHAPTER 3 Competing Development Paradigms and Alternative Evaluations of Aid Effectiveness: Challenging the Dominant Neoliberal Vision	 31
<i>John McKay</i>	
Introduction	31
A Political Economy Background	32
The Quest for Modernization: the Neoclassical Foundations	33
Dissenting Voices from the South: the Challenge of the Dependency Theory	35
Basic Needs	37

	The Rise of Neoliberalism: Globalization and Development Theory	38
	The Global Financial Crisis and Emerging Challenges to Neoliberalism	39
	Concluding Thoughts: Toward a New Development Paradigm and a New Role for Aid	42
	References.....	43
CHAPTER 4	Aid for Trade: A Critical Analysis	45
	<i>Viktor Jakupec</i>	
	Introduction.....	45
	Unpacking “Aid for Trade” within a Context of ODA	46
	The Increased Quest for Accountability	47
	AfT from Theoretical Underpinnings to Conceptualization.....	47
	A critique of AfT	49
	Trade not Aid	50
	Critique of the Neoliberal ODA Agenda	51
	Toward a Paradigm Shift in AfT.....	52
	Paradigm Shift: AfT as a Subset of VfM	53
	Around and Around; Back to Assessing Impact and Aid for Trade.....	55
	Conclusion	56
	References.....	57
CHAPTER 5	The Rhetoric and Reality of Results and Impact Assessment in Donor Agencies: A Practitioners’ Perspective.....	61
	<i>Simon Milligan, Steve Bertram, and Alwyn Chilver</i>	
	Introduction.....	62
	The Changing Aid Environment.....	62
	The Pursuit of Success.....	62
	Understanding the “Results Culture”.....	63
	The Accountability and Transparency Agenda	64
	The Learning and Efficacy Agenda	65
	A Fly in the Ointment?	65
	The Push for Impact Assessment.....	66
	The Changing Face of Impact Assessment.....	68
	Results Reporting and Impact Assessment in a Contested, Dynamic, and Political Environment	69
	Program Design	69
	Programme Delivery and Management	69
	Reporting, Accountability, and (Impact) Evaluation	70
	Lesson Learning and Application	72
	An Evolving Context?	72
	Looking Forward	73

	The Implications for Aid Investments and the Framing of Results	73
	The Implications for Impact Assessment.....	74
	Conclusion	75
	References.....	75
CHAPTER 6	Beyond Aid Distribution: Aid Effectiveness, Neoliberal and Neostructural Reforms in Pacific Island Countries.....	79
	<i>Amerita Ravuvu and Alec Thornton</i>	
	Introduction.....	79
	Overview of Development Aid	80
	Economic Reforms in Pics: Key Issues	81
	The Limitations of Economic Reforms	84
	Case Study 1: Sovi Basin Conservation Area in Fiji	85
	Case Study 2: Ongoing ADB Reform “Promoting Economic Use of Customary Land” in Samoa	87
	Conclusion	88
	References.....	90
CHAPTER 7	Regulatory Impact Assessment: The Forgotten Agenda in ODA.....	95
	<i>Viktor Jakupec and Max Kelly</i>	
	Introduction.....	95
	Defining RIA	96
	A Critical Analysis of MDB’s Contemporary Approaches to RIA.....	98
	The Neoliberal Agenda	99
	A Brief Ideological Critique	99
	A Brief Implementation Critique.....	101
	Inference: the Policy Cycle and the Project Cycle	101
	The Policy Cycle.....	101
	The Project Cycle	102
	A Pointer to Procedures: Transcending Policy and Project Cycle.....	102
	Applying RIA for ODA Projects and Programs	102
	Problematics of <i>Ex-Ante</i> RIA	103
	Conclusion: A Case in Favor of RIA in ODA	104
	References.....	105
CHAPTER 8	Can We Assess the Overall Impact of Development Agencies? The Example of Corporate Results Frameworks in Multilateral Development Banks.....	107
	<i>Marc M. Cohen</i>	
	Setting the Stage: Pressing for Results	108
	What are Corporate Results Frameworks?	109

How are Corporate Results Frameworks used in Practice?.....	112
Focus on Agency Results and Performance.....	112
Powerful Communication Tools	113
Simplicity and Economy.....	113
Strategic Alignment and Focus	113
Flexibility.....	113
Defining Limitations.....	114
The Assumed Global Causality	114
From Corporate Results to Country Results.....	114
From Operational Performance to Corporate Results	115
From Institutional Reforms to Operational Performance	115
Issues of Data Aggregation	115
Results Versus Risks	116
Short-Term Versus Long-Term Impact	117
Ownership and Politicization of the Agenda	117
New Avenues for New Realities	117
Improved Conceptual Underpinning	118
Quality Matters	118
Toward a Culture of Results	119
Priorities and Ownership	119
Toward Joint Integrated Frameworks.....	119
Conclusions.....	120
References.....	120

CHAPTER 9 Assessing the Impact of Knowledge on Development Partners..... 123

William Loxley

Introduction.....	123
Donor Initiated Evaluation Research.....	126
Case Study 1: Accelerating the Flow of Scientific Knowledge in Indonesia	128
Case Study 2: Institutional Capacity Building in the Maldives.....	130
Case Study 3: Choosing Funding Modalities for Project Integrity in Pakistan	132
Case Study 4: Computer-Assisted Instruction in Sri Lankan Schools.....	134
Summary and Conclusion.....	135
References.....	136

CHAPTER 10 From Evidence to Action: Stakeholder Coordination as a Determinant of Evaluation Use 137

Mateusz Pucilowski

Introduction.....	137
Background.....	138
Determinants of Evaluation Use.....	139
Evaluation Stakeholders	141

Points of Coordination	142
Procurement and Evaluation Predesign	142
Design	143
Dissemination	145
Conclusion	145
References	146
CHAPTER 11 Inside the Black Box: Modeling the Inner Workings of Social Development Programs	149
<i>Sebastian Lemire and Gordon Freer</i>	
Introduction	149
The Intellectual Roots and Grounding of Meta-Modeling	151
The Five Steps of Meta-Modeling	153
The Application of Meta-Modeling	155
Step 1: Define the Research Question	156
Step 2: Search and Retrieve Studies	157
Step 3: Relevance Appraisal	158
Step 4: Code Studies	159
Step 5: Develop a Meta-Summary	161
Final Thoughts on Meta-Modeling	165
Studies Included in Review	167
References	168
CHAPTER 12 Impact Assessment and Official Development Assistance: Ethnographic Research of the World Bank's Community-Based Rural Development Projects in Ghana	169
<i>Kwadwo Adusei-Asante and Peter Hancock</i>	
Introduction	169
Applied Ethnography	171
The Four Dimensional Ethnographic Impact Assessment Framework	172
Planning	172
Participative Presence	173
Reflective Flexibility	174
Ethical Representation	174
The World Bank's CBRDP in Ghana: Summary of Ethnographic Research Findings	175
"Highly Functional" Decentralization System and CDD Programs	175
When Empowerment Disempowers	178
Community-Based Program in Nonexistent Communities	178
Discussion	179
Conclusion	180
References	181

CHAPTER 13 Finding Balance: Improving Monitoring to Improve Impact Assessments of Development Programmes	183
<i>Donna Loveridge</i>	
Introduction.....	183
Part 1 – Key Definitions and Concepts	185
Part 2 – The Rise of Impact Assessment.....	187
Gold Standard Methods	188
Independence	189
Part 3 – The Status of Monitoring and its Future	190
Part 4 – Emerging Approaches to Improve Monitoring.....	192
Conclusion	194
References.....	196
CHAPTER 14 Impact Assessment in Practice: Case Studies from Save the Children Programs in Lao PDR and Afghanistan	199
<i>Veronica Bell and Yasamin Alttahir</i>	
Introduction.....	200
Save the Children Australia	200
Save the Children’s Global Theory of Change	200
Measuring Our Results	201
Primary Health Care Program, Sayaboury and Luang Prabang	
Provinces, Lao PDR.....	202
Background.....	202
Understanding and Working within Local Systems.....	203
A Contextually Relevant Approach to Measuring Results	203
Building the Evidence Base – Making the Case for Scale-Up	204
The Importance of Time	205
Children of Uruzgan Program, Uruzgan Province, Afghanistan	206
Background.....	206
Understanding and Working Within Local Systems.....	207
A Contextually Relevant Approach to Measuring Results	207
Building the Evidence Base – Making the Case for Scale-Up	208
The Importance of Time	210
Challenges Associated with Impact Assessment	211
Timeframes	211
Cost-Effectiveness	212
<i>Ex-Post</i> Evaluations	212
Conclusion	212
References.....	213

CHAPTER 15 The Nongovernmental Development Sector and Impact Assessment	215
<i>Jonathan J. Makuwira</i>	
Introduction.....	215
Contemporary Debates in Impact Assessment	216
Impact Assessment Methods and Tools	218
The Logic Model	218
Program Logic and Theory of Change	219
The Most Significant Change	220
Participatory Rural Appraisal/Participatory Learning Action.....	221
Tiny Tools	221
Challenges of Impact Assessment and the Way Forward	223
References.....	224
CHAPTER 16 Impact Assessment: from Theory to Practice	227
<i>Viktor Jakupec and Max Kelly</i>	
Introduction.....	227
Development Theory and Global Economic Paradigms.....	229
The Elephant in the Room...Politics and Foreign Policy.....	229
Complexity.....	230
Impact... ..	231
Conceptual Understandings	231
Methodology and Method.....	232
Impact Assessment in the Real World – <i>Ex-Ante</i> , <i>Ex-Post</i> , or Somewhere in Between?	233
Conclusion	234
References.....	235
Index	237